
Motion Landmark Alteration Permit to allow exterior modifications to the façade of an existing commercial building (Goodwill) in the Local Landmark District, including new murals and shorter awnings.

REPORT IN BRIEF:

Existing Site Conditions

One-Story Commercial Building

Surrounding Land Uses

North City Parking Lot
South Parking Lot (Macy’s) across E. Washington Ave.
East Commercial (Auto Repair) across S. Sunnyvale Ave.
West Commercial

Issues

Design Consistency with Murphy Avenue Design Guidelines

Environmental Status

A Class 1 Categorical Exemption relieves this project from California Environmental Quality Act provisions and City Guidelines.

Staff Recommendation

Approve with Conditions
PROJECT DATA TABLE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>EXISTING</th>
<th>PROPOSED</th>
<th>REQUIRED/PERMITTED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Plan</td>
<td>Downtown Specific Plan</td>
<td>Same</td>
<td>Downtown Specific Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoning District</td>
<td>DSP-2</td>
<td>Same</td>
<td>DSP-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lot Size (s.f.)</td>
<td>11,880</td>
<td>Same</td>
<td>No min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross Floor Area (s.f.)</td>
<td>9,180</td>
<td>Same</td>
<td>No max.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lot Coverage (%)</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>Same</td>
<td>77% max.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building Height (ft.)</td>
<td>24’</td>
<td>Same</td>
<td>36’ max.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of Stories</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Same</td>
<td>2 max.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BACKGROUND:

In March of this year, a Landmark Alteration Permit (2012-7892) was approved for the existing commercial building, occupied by Goodwill of Silicon Valley, located at 151 E. Washington Avenue. The project included repainting of the façade to a different color (beige and brown) as well as changes to the design and positioning of the awnings. These planned improvements have not yet been implemented. The current proposal for a Landmark Alteration Permit is to consider further modifications to the building including the installation of murals at three locations and changes to the previously approved awnings (See “Discussion” section). The previous application had included the possible future installation of a mural on the building; however, the design was conceptual at the time. As part of the approval action, the Commissioners noted that if a mural were planned to be installed; the proposal would be brought back to the Heritage Preservation Commission for review.

A Landmark Alteration Permit is required for any exterior modification to buildings in the Local Landmark District. The building was included as part of the adopted district since it is located on an adjacent parcel to those properties on Murphy Avenue and is considered a logical connection; however, it does not share the same historic commercial street or building history. The architectural review is the responsibility of the Heritage Preservation Commission.

Previous Actions on the Site
The following table summarizes previous planning applications related to the project site.
The original building contained frontage only on Washington Avenue and had consisted of a second floor. The building was remodeled and expanded in 1985 (approved in 1984). The expansion increased the size of the building towards the street corner of the site and along Sunnyvale Avenue. Although the second floor was removed, the building retained a two-story appearance. As stated previously, the modifications associated with the most recent approved permit (2012-7892) have not yet been installed.

**DISCUSSION:**

**Landmark Alteration Permit**

The scope of the Landmark Alteration Permit consists of the installation of the three murals on the upper portion of the buildings at three locations facing the street. Additionally, the awnings along a portion of the E. Washington and S. Sunnyvale Avenue would be modified. These awnings would be shortened to the similar length as the awnings located at the western end of the building. As a result, the awnings would all be of similar length. To see a comparison of the previously approved design, reference Page 4 of Attachment C. The current proposal would not alter the previously approved paint color scheme. No modifications are planned for the rear portion of the building that faces the public parking lot.

- **Site/Floor Plan**

The building is positioned at the corner of the property facing the intersection of E. Washington Avenue and S. Sunnyvale Avenue. The primary customer entrance is positioned at the corner. A loading/donation area is positioned at the back of the building which faces the City-owned parking lot. The site & floor plans will not be modified as part of the proposal.

- **Murals**

The proposal includes three murals to be installed along the upper portions of three different walls that face the public streets. The design intent of the
murals is to be representative of Sunnyvale’s history. Each mural would cover an area of the wall between the two horizontal bands (painted a similar brown color as the awnings) within the vertical pilasters that separate sections of the building. Mural “A”, would occupy a 7’ by 30’ area (210 s.f) along the wall facing E. Washington Ave. The design of this mural would represent the City’s technological roots. Mural “B”, would occupy a 7’ by 25’ area (175 s.f.) and be located along the wall that faces the street intersection. This mural would include a scene representing the City’s agricultural origins. Lastly, mural “C”, would occupy a 7’ by 30’ area (210 s.f) along the wall would facing S. Sunnyvale Ave. This mural includes a historical downtown scene with an image of the Sunnyvale railroad station. These images designed by a local artist, Morgan Bricca are provided in Attachment E.

The proposed murals would be at locations currently occupied by signs. Future signage will be required to conform to Murphy Avenue Design Guidelines but can be considered at staff level through a separate sign permit application, as noted in the Conditions of Approval.

**ANALYSIS:**

The proposed exterior modifications were not considered significant to warrant a historical impact analysis. The modified awnings are considered a minor modification to the previously approved Landmark Alteration Permit and are in character with the building’s form and architectural design.

Typically, voluntary art installations on privately owned commercial buildings are exempt from Municipal Code requirements. Since the subject site is located within the City’s Local Landmark District, modifications to the exterior of buildings require review and approval by the Heritage Preservation Commission. However, the specific content and design of such art cannot be restricted as a matter of free speech rights. The location and amount of area of the installation can be reviewed for appropriateness and its context to the building’s architectural design. The Murphy Avenue Design Guidelines do not contain further direction for such art installations within the district. Staff has included Condition of Approval GC-6 to ensure future maintenance and subsequent review for later modifications.
Applicable Design Guidelines and Policy Documents

| Murphy Avenue Design Guidelines (Awnings) | Many of the Murphy Avenue buildings were designed to have a retractable 45-degree angle awning. | The awnings have been redesigned to match the existing awnings at the western end of the building along E. Washington Avenue. As approved with the previous Landmark Alteration Permit, the awnings located at the corner (facing the intersection) are planned to be removed. |

Environmental Review

A Class 1 Categorical Exemption relieves this project from California Environmental Quality Act provisions. Class 1 Categorical Exemptions include minor alterations to existing private structures.

FISCAL IMPACT

No fiscal impacts other than normal fees and taxes are expected.

PUBLIC CONTACT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notice of Negative Declaration and Public Hearing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Published in the Sun newspaper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Posted on the site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 224 notices mailed to the property owners and tenants within 300 ft. of the project site</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Staff Report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Posted on the City of Sunnyvale's Website</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Provided at the Reference Section of the City of Sunnyvale's Public Library</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agenda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Posted on the City's official notice bulletin board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- City of Sunnyvale's Website</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONCLUSION

Findings and General Plan Goals: Staff was able to make the required Findings based on the justifications for the Landmark Alteration Permit. Recommended Findings and General Plan Goals are located in Attachment A.
Conditions of Approval: Recommended Conditions of Approval are located in Attachment B.

ALTERNATIVES

1. Approve the Landmark Alteration Permit with attached conditions.
2. Approve the Landmark Alteration Permit with modified conditions.
3. Deny the Landmark Alteration Permit.

RECOMMENDATION

Alternative 1.

Prepared by:
Ryan M. Kuchenig
Project Planner

Approved by:
Gerri Caruso
Principal Planner

Attachments:

A. Recommended Findings
B. Recommended Conditions of Approval
C. Site and Architectural Plans
D. Photos of the Existing Building
E. Proposed Murals
RECOMMENDED FINDINGS

Landmark Alteration Permit

Community Character Chapter - Heritage Preservation
Policy CC-5.2: Enhance the visual character of the city by preserving diverse as well as harmonious architectural styles and design preferences which reflect various phases of the City’s history and cultural traditions of past and present residents.

1. The proposed project will be consistent with the purposes of the Heritage Preservation Ordinance. *(Finding Met)*

The proposed murals and modifications to the awnings are consistent with City ordinances and design guidelines. The redesigned awnings are considered minor changes from the previously approved design and are similar in form to existing awnings on the building. The size and location of the murals are considered compatible to the Art Deco design of the building and will serve as an aesthetic improvement to a prominent downtown street corner. The proposed modifications also respect the character of the Murphy Avenue commercial district.

2. The proposal will not be detrimental to the significant historical features of the building.

The project incorporates art that is representative of Sunnyvale and the local area and is not detrimental to the existing building’s Art Deco architectural form. The project will enhance the general appearance of the site as well as surrounding area. Conditions of Approval ensure that the murals are continuously maintained and that certain future modifications require separate public hearing review.
RECOMMENDED
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL AND
STANDARD DEVELOPMENT REQUIREMENTS
DECEMBER 4, 2013

Planning Application 2013-7853
151 E. Washington Avenue
Landmark Alteration Permit to allow exterior modifications to the façade of an existing commercial building (Goodwill) including new murals and shorter awnings.

The following Conditions of Approval [COA] and Standard Development Requirements [SDR] apply to the project referenced above. The COAs are specific conditions applicable to the proposed project. The SDRs are items which are codified or adopted by resolution and have been included for ease of reference, they may not be appealed or changed. The COAs and SDRs are grouped under specific headings that relate to the timing of required compliance. Additional language within a condition may further define the timing of required compliance. Applicable mitigation measures are noted with “Mitigation Measure” and placed in the applicable phase of the project.

In addition to complying with all applicable City, County, State and Federal Statutes, Codes, Ordinances, Resolutions and Regulations, Permittee expressly accepts and agrees to comply with the following Conditions of Approval and Standard Development Requirements of this Permit:

GC: THE FOLLOWING GENERAL CONDITIONS AND STANDARD DEVELOPMENT REQUIREMENTS SHALL APPLY TO THE APPROVED PROJECT.

GC-1. CONFORMANCE WITH APPROVED PLANNING APPLICATION:
All building permit drawings and subsequent construction and operation shall substantially conform with the approved planning application, including: drawings/plans, materials samples, building colors, and other items submitted as part of the approved application. Any proposed amendments to the approved plans or Conditions of Approval are subject to review and approval by the City. The Director of Community Development shall determine whether revisions are considered major or minor. Minor changes are subject to review and approval by the Director of Community Development. Major changes are subject to review at a public hearing. [COA] [PLANNING]

GC-2. PERMIT EXPIRATION:
The permit shall be null and void two years from the date of approval by the final review authority at a public hearing if the approval is not exercised, unless a written request for an extension is received prior
to expiration date and is approved by the Director of Community Development. [SDR] [PLANNING]

GC-3. TITLE 25:
Provisions of Title 25 of the California Administrative Code shall be satisfied with dependence on mechanical ventilation. [SDR] [BUILDING]

GC-4. SIGNS:
All new signs shall require a separate Sign Permit and shall be in conformance with development standards and the Murphy Avenue Design Guidelines. [PLANNING] [COA]

GC-5 AWNINGS:
Fabric awnings shall be replaced at least every five years. Any future change of color, materials or design are subject to review and approval by the Heritage Preservation Commission. Minor modifications may be approved by the Director of Community Development. [COA] [PLANNING]

GC-6. MURALS:
The murals shall be maintained in good condition after installation. Repainting of the murals shall occur if colors are faded or they become damaged. Any future changes to the location or the addition of new murals shall be subject to separate review by the Heritage Preservation Commission through a public hearing, prior to installation. Removal of one or each of murals is permitted and does not require separate action by City staff or the Heritage Preservation Commission. If murals are removed, the affected area shall be painted to match the rest of the building. [PLANNING] [COA]

GC-7. CONFORMANCE WITH PREVIOUS PLANNING PERMIT:
The subject site shall comply with all conditions of approval and requirements of planning application 2012-7892. [PLANNING] [COA]

BP: THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS SHALL BE ADDRESSED ON THE CONSTRUCTION PLANS SUBMITTED FOR ANY DEMOLITION PERMIT, BUILDING PERMIT, GRADING PERMIT, AND/OR ENCROACHMENT PERMIT AND SHALL BE MET PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF SAID PERMIT(S).
BP-1. CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:
Final Building Permit plans shall include all Conditions of Approval as part of the approved application starting on sheet 2 of the plans. [COA] [PLANNING]

BP-2. BLUEPRINT FOR A CLEAN BAY:
The building permit plans shall include a “Blueprint for a Clean Bay” on one full sized sheet of the plans. [SDR] [PLANNING]

BP-3. ROOF EQUIPMENT:
Roof vents, pipes and flues shall be combined and/or collected together on slopes of roof or behind parapets out of public view as per Title 19 of the Sunnyvale Municipal Code and shall be painted to match the roof. [COA] [PLANNING]

BP-4. SIDEWALK:
Any damage to the existing sidewalk, fixtures or utilities as a result of construction work shall be restored to conditions prior to or better than conditions at the commencement of work. Instruments of bond and certificate of insurance may be required prior to issuance of Building permit. [COA] [PUBLIC WORKS]

BP-5. STOREFRONT WINDOWS AND DOORS:
All window and door glass shall remain clear and without tint so that visibility into the building interior is possible from the sidewalk and street. [COA] [PLANNING]
PROJECT DATA:
LOT SIZE: 30' X 130'  9,900 SQ. FT.
BUILDING AREA: 2,400 SQ. FT.

ARCHITECTURAL: MEMORIE ASSOCIATES
1500 WILSHIRE BLVD
SANTA MONICA, CA 90403

SHEET INDEX:
A-1 Site Plan
A-2 Existing Elevations
A-3 New Elevations

SCOPE OF WORK:
1. Remove the panels of the entrance at the corner.
2. Cut between the bottom frame of each panel of the entrance at the junctions of Washington Ave. and Sunnyvale Ave.
3. Paint the extension of the building.

DCM:

MEMORIE ASSOCIATES
1500 WILSHIRE BLVD
SANTA MONICA, CA 90403

Site Plan

A-1

GRAPHIC SCALE
100'=1'-0"
WASHINGTON AVE. ELEVATION

ENTRANCE ELEVATION & CORNER

SUNNYVALE AVE. ELEVATION

REAR ELEVATION

Sign through separate permit
Mural "A" - E. Washington Ave.
Mural "B" - Corner

Proposed design for panel B:

- Scenic 
- Ranch
- Large Oaks
- Irrigation
- Horse
- Farmhouse
- Fence

Crop: Trees:

Apricot Tree
Mural "C" - S. Sunnyvale Ave.